



Table 11.1 Alternatives Evaluation Matrix

Evaluation Criteria		No-Build Alternative	Build Alternative - Industrial Drive River Crossing Corridor	Build Alternative - Enterprise Avenue (Road 12) River Crossing Corridor	Comments
Purpose and Need Elements	Improve Traffic Operations on SR108 Bridge & Corridor	No Benefit – Traffic on existing bridge is currently at LOS D, and is projected to be borderline LOS D/E in 2035 if no other river crossing is constructed nearby.	Substantial Benefit – This location provides most draw of traffic from the existing SR108 bridge. Improves existing bridge to LOS C in 2015 and reduces delays in 2035. Industrial Drive bridge operates at LOS C through design year 2035.	Some Benefit – This location draws some traffic from the existing SR108 bridge, but not as much as Industrial Drive. Enterprise Avenue (Road 12) operates at LOS C through design year 2035.	No-Build does not satisfy P&N Element; Industrial Drive satisfies P&N Element the best of the two build alternatives as it draws most traffic from existing bridge.
	Improve Safety by Decreasing Crashes on the Corridor	No Benefit – The No-Build would not reduce traffic and congestion on existing corridors.	Substantial Benefit – Draws most truck and vehicular traffic off existing bridge and corridors leading to the bridge, which will reduce crash frequency due to lower traffic & congestion.	Some Benefit – Draws some traffic from existing bridge and corridors leading to bridge, but not as much as Industrial Drive location. Also requires traffic to negotiate on local roads since no direct access to US 6/US 24 interchange like Industrial Drive Corridor.	No-Build does not satisfy P&N Element; Industrial Drive satisfies P&N Element the best, as it reduces traffic the most on existing corridors which will reduce crash frequencies and enhance safety.
	Improve Access to Future and Planned Development on Both Sides of Maumee River	No Benefit – The No-Build does not provide a link between Future and Planned Development Areas on both sides of the river.	Substantial Benefit – This is the most direct connection between SR 110 south of the river and industrial developments on both sides of Industrial Drive, which also connects to interchange.	Substantial Benefit – Connects industrial developments on both sides of the river. However, this location is not as a direct link as Industrial Drive location.	No-Build does not satisfy P&N Element; Both Industrial Drive and Enterprise Avenue provide substantial benefit
	Consistency with Local Comprehensive Plans	No Consistency – The No-Build does not satisfy local Comprehensive Plans as it does not provide a new river crossing to connect development areas.	Substantial Consistency – This is the preferred location per local plans and government officials as it provides the most benefit as it provides most direct connection between future development areas on both sides of the river and the US 6/24 interchange	Some Consistency – This location does provide a new river crossing as cited in the Comprehensive Plan, however it does not provide best connection to developed areas and does not provide direct link to the US 6/24 interchange like the Industrial Drive corridor does.	No-Build does not satisfy P&N Element; Industrial Drive is the actual recommended location in the local Comprehensive Plan.
Environmental Elements	Cultural Resources	No Impacts – Since this is No-Build Option.	Potential Impacts – Further field studies needed to determine presence of archaeological sites and evaluate project impacts.	Potential Impacts – Further field studies needed to determine presence of archaeological sites and evaluate project impacts.	No impacts from No-Build; Potential impacts from both of the build alternatives.
	Parks/4(f)	No Impacts – Since this is No-Build Option.	Potential Impacts – Project could impact the Buckeye Trail.	Likely Impacts – Project likely impacts a public park found on northern banks of river that could be 4(f), as well as Buckeye Trail.	No impacts from No-Build; Potential impacts from both of the build alternatives.
	Farmland Impacts	No Impacts – Since this is No-Build Option.	Likely Impacts – Farmland on south side of river likely impacted.	Likely Impacts – Farmland on south side of river likely impacted.	No impacts from No-Build; Potential impacts from both of the build alternatives.
	FEMA 100-year Flood Plain	No Impacts – Since this is No-Build Option.	Potential Impacts – Project could impact the 100-Yr. Flood Plain, however bridge span may allow avoidance of impacts.	Likely Impacts – Project likely impacts the 100-Yr. Flood Plain as there is unavoidable area on south side of the river.	No impacts from No-Build; Potential impacts from both of the build alternatives.
	Endangered & Threatened Species	No Impacts – Since this is No-Build Option.	Potential Impacts – There are potential threatened/endangered mussels in river and possible Indiana Bat habitat. Mussel survey would be needed to determine if present & relocations required.	Potential Impacts – There are potential threatened/endangered mussels in river and possible Indiana Bat habitat. Mussel survey would be needed to determine if present & if so, relocations required.	No impacts from No-Build; Potential impacts from both of the build alternatives.
	Ecological Resources	No Impacts – Since this is No-Build Option.	Likely Impacts – Any alignment in the corridor would involve in-stream work that would require a Section 404 permit from USACE, a Section 401 Water Quality Certification from Ohio EPA, and Scenic River coordination with ODNR. Two small wetlands also found within the corridor that may be impacted.	Likely Impacts – Any alignment in the corridor would involve in-stream work that would require a Section 404 permit from USACE, a Section 401 Water Quality Certification from Ohio EPA, and Scenic River coordination with ODNR. A potential regulated ditch is also found within the corridor along the western side of the corridor.	No impacts from No-Build; Likely impacts from both build alternatives given the scope of the project involving in-stream work and new bridge construction.
Environmental Site Assessments	No Impacts – Since this is No-Build Option.	Potential Impacts – There are two small potential ESA sites (#6 & #8) located between the former Miami-Erie Canal and the River.	Potential Impacts – There is a large potential ESA site (#11) within the corridor associated with the Campbell's Soup facility.	No impacts from No-Build; Potential impacts from both of the build alternatives.	
Community Elements	Connectivity to Highway System	No Improvement – The No-Build does not enhance highway connections.	Substantial Benefit – Provides direct connection to the US 6/24 interchange via Industrial Drive Corridor.	Some Benefit – Provides some benefit in connectivity, however there is no direct access to US 6/24 as Executive Avenue does not have interchange and several local roads would be used to access US 6/24.	No-Build provides no improvement while the Industrial Drive Corridor provides a substantial benefit given the direct connection to the US 6/24 interchange.
	Reduce Downtown Traffic Congestion & Enhance Safety	Negative Impact – The No-Build does nothing to reduce congestion and enhance safety, and no action will actually degrade conditions further in future.	Substantial Benefit – Provides largest capture of truck and vehicular traffic from the existing SR 108 Bridge and improves existing bridge LOS on Opening Day to a LOS C.	Some Benefit – Provides some benefit in capturing traffic from the existing SR 108 Bridge; however the lack of direct access to US 6/24 does not allow for as much of captured traffic as Industrial Drive.	No-Build provides negative impact as no action will actually degrade as traffic grows; Industrial Drive provides substantial benefit in reducing delays/traffic.
	Enhance Emergency Response and Hospital Access	No Improvement – The No-Build does not enhance emergency response and hospital access.	Some Benefit – Provides some benefit to enhancing emergency responses and hospital access, especially if existing bridge blocked.	Some Benefit – Provides some benefit to enhancing emergency responses and hospital access, especially if existing bridge blocked.	No-Build provides no improvement; both build alternatives provide some benefit.
	Right-of-Way and Property Impacts	No Impacts – The No-Build does not impact properties as no Right-of-Way is needed.	Likely Impacts – Corridor is new facility, and will require property acquisition. This alternative may require a total take of a residential parcel, however property owner has indicated desire to sell.	Likely Impacts – Corridor is new facility, and will require property acquisition.	No impact from No-Build; Impacts to properties will occur as roadway is a new facility on new alignment.
	Economic Development Benefits	Negative Impacts – The No-Build does not enhance highway connections.	Substantial Benefit – Provides direct link of south side of river at SR 110 northward to the US 6/24 interchange and corridors. This provides maximum transportation benefit for Campbell's Soup facility and other existing industrial sites and future development areas.	Some Benefit – Provides connection of developed areas on south side of river to those on north side of river. This alternative however does not have direct link to the US 6/24 interchange and corridors.	No-Build will lead to higher transportation costs to businesses and public as traffic congestion increases. Industrial Drive would provide substantial benefit given direct link to US 6/24 interchange and traffic reductions.
Construction	Costs	No Costs for this is a No-Build Option	\$15.0 Million	\$19.4 Million	Enterprise Avenue alternative is considerably higher cost than Industrial Drive alternative due to a significantly longer project length and a substantial cost to relocate an existing electric transmission line over the Maumee River.
	Constructability	No Constructability Issues as this is a No-Build Option	Moderate Constructability Issues – Maumee River is typically less than 10' deep at this location; minor utility impacts; barges will be required to construct bridge; borrow for embankments close to site; no fill required in river; well established bridge & road construction methods required; MOT will require one-way traffic maintenance	Moderate Constructability Issues – Maumee River is typically less than 10' deep at this location; major power utility relocation over river; barges will be required to construct bridge; borrow for embankments close to site; no fill required in river; well established bridge & road construction methods required; MOT will require one-way traffic maintenance	Enterprise Avenue Alternative somewhat more complex to build due to longer bridge and major power utility relocation over river required.

Legend

 Provides Substantial Benefit Relative to Purpose and Need and/or Will Not Negatively Impact Environmental Resource

 Provides Some Benefit Relative to Purpose and Need and/or Has Potential to Negatively Impact Environmental Resource

 Provides No Benefit Relative to Purpose and Need and/or Will Likely Negative Impact to Environmental Resource